MEMORANDUM

BY COURIER

TO:

Andrew White

FROM:

Michael T. Buckley

DATE:

1 November 1991

RE:

EEMA Rush to Judgment Brochure

You will recall that at our meeting in London on 22 October Stig asked for our comments on the US version of the EPA brochure.

Various editorial comments are marked on the attached copy. In addition, I am attaching a list of quotations from some of the European scientists' comments that were filed with EPA. You could select from these quotations as you like, depending on considerations of length, but I would not recommend using only European comments. Some of the US quotations are quite good, and it is important to show that even in the US, where the antis' position gets so much attention, many scientists do not agree.

The use of the baseball analogy for meta-analysis on page 9 is problematic. Clearly you cannot retain a discussion of American baseball in a brochure intended for Europeans (too bad it is not intended for a Japanese audience). I have wracked my brain to come up with a popular European sport whose scoring system would fit the analogy. Unfortunately, the obvious choice, soccer, does not work. You could perhaps use tennis and describe a situation where one player could win fewer sets than his opponent and still win the match by winning more games (e.g. 3 sets won at 6-4 and 2 sets lost at 0-6, so the winner under actual tennis rules has won 18 games while his opponent has won 24 games). In my view, however, telling this story would be too complex and would just confuse readers, so you are probably better off not getting into sports analogies.

Regarding Stig's concern about using Gray Robertson's name in the text, I think that this could be resolved in one of two ways:

- (1) Keep the text but drop the Robertson/HBI reference and edit as shown on the attached copy; or
- (2) Insert a reference to a recent paper by W.A. Crawford (in Other People's Tobacco Smoke), as shown in Attachment 2.

501360476

Finally, I think that the conclusion would flow better if the paragraphs were reordered somewhat. You may want to tinker further with this section at your end as well.

Give me a call if you have any questions.

Regards,

M

Michael T. Buckley

cc: Stig Carlson (w/atts)

7 3